

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION
CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA, CALIFORNIA
CONVENED THIS 21ST DAY OF FEBRUARY, 2013
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 1424 MISSION STREET**

ROLL CALL

The Meeting convened at: 6:45 PM

Commissioners Present: Robert Conte (Chair), John Lesak (Vice-Chair),
West J. De Young, James McLane, and Deborah
Howell-Ardilla

Council Liaison Absent: Michael A. Cacciotti, Councilmember

Staff Liaison Present: John Mayer, Senior Planner

NON-AGENDA
PUBLIC COMMENT
PERIOD

1. None

CONTINUED
APPLICATIONS

2. **505 Prospect Avenue**
Applicant: Kiyohara Moffitt, *Architect*
Project #: 1573-COA

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a 775 sq. ft. single story addition, a 560 sq. ft. second story addition, and a new 561 sq. ft. storage basement. The existing house consisted of a; 2,560 sq. ft., two story, Spanish Colonial Revival on a 19,109 sq. ft. lot. The first story addition will consist of a library, powered room, and loggia. The second story addition will consist of a master suite. The materials for the addition will consistent with the existing house; smooth trowelled plaster, single glazed wood windows, true divided lites, and simple iron railings.

The current proposal would require the removal of two (2) trees. If the Cultural Heritage Commission approves this project, the Natural Resources and Environmental Commission (NREC) would then review the proposal to remove the trees at a future meeting.

Presentation: Ms. Moffitt provided an overview of the changes to her project.

Dr. Lauren Bricker provided her support to the project based on her professional qualifications in Historic Preservation.

Public Comment: None

Discussion/Vote:

Commissioners discussed the scale, massing, and design details of the project. Commissioner Howell-Ardilla raised concerns about the project's impacts to the home's status on the Cultural Heritage Inventory.

The Commission voted 4-1 (Lesak – Conte, Howell-Ardilla Opposed) to **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project based on the finding that it is appropriate to the size, massing and design context of the neighborhood.

The Commission also finds that the design and layout of the proposed project is consistent with all four findings contained in the SPMC Section 36.410.040(I) - Design Review Required Findings.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 505 Prospect Avenue as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

3. **1500 Spruce Street**
Applicant: David Haas, Homeowner
Project #: 1582-COA

Project Description:

A request for Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of a 440 sq. ft. detached garage and construct an 864 sq. ft. detached, three vehicle garage. The new garage will be 21' high, to match the existing house's roof design. The garage materials will consist of; composition fiberglass shingles, wood panel siding, double hung wood windows, and wood trim to match the existing house. The proposed garage doors are; painted sectional garage doors with Faux hinge hardware: Clopay "Coachman" series. The new detached garage will be located in the rear of the property. The existing structure is a two story, 4,584 sq. ft. Craftsman/Shingle Influence house on a 16,977 sq. ft. lot.

Presentation: Phil Dube presented his project and noted that the Sanborn map, dated 1910 has no garage. Mr. Dube said that the garage cannot be restored and will not accommodate a vehicle. He also responded to questions about massing, dormers, and transom windows above the garage door.

Public Comment: None

The Commission voted 4-1 (Conte - Howell-Ardilla, McLane Opposed) to **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project based on the finding that it the existing garage is beyond repair and that the new garage fits within the design theme of the house.

The Commission also finds that the design and layout of the proposed project is consistent with all four findings contained in the SPMC Section 36.410.040(I) - Design Review Required Findings.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the

property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 1500 Spruce Street as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

NEW ITEMS

4. **1040 Garfield Avenue**
Applicant: Peter De Maria, Architect
Project #: 1484-COA

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the approval in regards to the unpermitted garage conversion into a 1,163 sq. ft. living area, the unpermitted conversion of a 640 sq. ft. carport in to a detached 640 sq. ft. garage, a proposed new single story addition of 720 sq. ft., a 200 sq. ft. storage addition to the detached garage, and a proposed 476 sq. ft. deck. The 720 sq. ft. addition will consist of a dining area, a kitchen, and a sitting area. The proposed exterior materials for the addition will consist of; aluminum clad windows, James Hardie siding on the north elevation, tempered glass on the south elevation, and composite roof shingles or a flat roof. The CHC will decide the best proposal for the roof. The exterior garage materials consist of James Hardie siding and composite roof shingles. The same materials will be used for the garage addition. The 476 sq. ft. deck will be located in the rear and will be made out of wood.

The current proposal would require the removal of one (1) 15" Ash Tree. If the Cultural Heritage Commission approves this project, the Natural Resources and Environmental Commission (NREC) would then review the proposal to remove the tree at a future meeting.

Presentation:

Peter De Maria (project architect) presented his project and responded to questions about the proposed changes to the existing structures and the two design proposals, the original garage and why the City should approve it as living space, the exterior wall assembly, lack of windows on a portion of the northern elevation, changes made to garage under current ownership, and whether there was any outreach with the neighbors regarding this proposal.

Public Comment:

Greg Louie (1108 Garfield) said that he likes the concept, but the back part is a mess. He knows what was there and is disappointed with the approach that the owner has taken to get that work approved.

Discussion/Vote:

The Commission discussed the project and determined that additional information is needed.

The Commission voted 5-0 (Conte-Lesak) to **CONTINUE** this item so that the applicant can return with the following:

- Report on whether the owner is willing to install wood framed windows,
 - Elevations of original back building and how it appeared when the owner bought the property,
 - Justification from the owner as to why the rear structure should be approved, and
 - Clear and distinct drawings that depict what has changed over time to illustrate non-permitted work and new additional work that has yet to be approved
-

5. **820 Milan Avenue**
Applicant: Tom Nott, Architect
Project #: 1589-COA

Project Description:

A request for Certificate of Appropriateness for a 9 sq. ft. addition, expanding the kitchen area, to an existing 2,383 sq. ft. two story Craftsman style house on a 19,113 sq. ft. lot. The proposed addition is located in the rear of the property. The exterior changes will consist of, replacing wood siding panels with James Hardie board panels. Stucco siding will be replaced with James Hardie board panels. 6 new wood windows are being proposed. The type of windows will be double hung, casement, fix, and sliding. Two sets of wood sliding doors are also being proposed.

Presentation:

Tom Nott (project architect) presented his project and responded to questions about the proposed design of the porch supports and proposed exterior material.

Public Comment: None

Discussion/Vote:

The Commission discussed the porch improvements and how the home's style evolved over time. Questions were raised about the originality of the porch and year of construction. Concerns were raised about the inappropriateness of allowing alterations that create a false sense of history.

The Commission voted 5-0 (Conte-McLane) to **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project, except for the porch improvements. The design details for the front porch shall be stricken from the plans. The project (minus the porch improvements) was approved on the finding that it fits within the design context of the neighborhood.

The Commission also finds that the design and layout of the proposed project is consistent with all four findings contained in the SPMC Section 36.410.040(I) - Design Review Required Findings.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, consideration of the application, and all

written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 820 Milan Avenue as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

6. **811-813 Fair Oaks Avenue**
Applicant: Ken McKently, Architect
Project #: 1590-COA

Project Description:

A request for Certificate of Appropriateness for a façade change to a 6,084 sq. ft. commercial building. The architectural style of the building is Vernacular. The proposed façade changes will consist of; new windows, relocating the existing signage for the tenants, ceramic tile, awnings, and painted plaster with smooth finish.

Presentation:

Ken McKently (applicant) presented his project and responded to questions about what was uncovered from the walls during the investigation and whether the Radio Shack can sign be removed for channel letters.

Public Comment: None

Discussion/Vote:

The Commission voted 5-0 (Conte-McLane) to **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project. A Chair Review of the transom window details are required prior to submitting plans for Building Permits. The project was approved on the finding that the design is an appropriate fit within the existing streetscape.

The Commission also finds that the design and layout of the proposed project is consistent with all four findings contained in the SPMC Section 36.410.040(I) - Design Review Required Findings.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 811-813 Fair Oaks Avenue as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

7. **1123 Stratford Avenue**
Applicant: Mike Layns, *Applicant*
Project #: 1594-COA

Project Description:

A request for Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of a 361 sq. ft. detached garage and construct a 609 sq. ft. detached, two vehicle garage with a 163 sq. ft. storage area. The existing house is a, 1,546 sq. ft. single story Craftsman on a 7,486 sq. ft. lot. The exterior garage materials will consist of redwood siding and stucco siding, since the garage is located within 5' of the property line. Double hung wood windows are being proposed. An Administrative Use Permit is required to allow the proposed detached garage to remain with the existing side yard setback from the property line.

Presentation:

Joan Laidig (property owner) presented her project and responded to questions about the stucco, roof overhanging the property line, clarification about which walls are existing and walls that are proposed.

Public Comment: None

Discussion/Vote:

Commissioners discussed the need for documentation about whether the garage can be salvaged. There was further discussion about the authenticity of the rear house to the garage and that the project is clearly visible from the street. Commissioners requested to see a Sanborn Map.

The Commission voted 5-0 (Conte-Lesak) to **CONTINUE** this item so that the applicant and staff can arrange a site visit for Commissioners to see the property.

8. **905 Monterey Rd**
Applicant: Liza Kerrigan, *Architect*
Project #: 1596-COA

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to permit an unpermitted addition to the rear of the house and construct a tandem carport at the rear of the existing single-car garage. A minor change is proposed to the addition at the rear of the house in order to comply with the required separation between structures. The addition to the house is 200 square feet and the proposed carport is 296 square feet. Exterior materials will match that of the original house except the windows which are metal frame windows.

Presentation:

Liza Kerrigan (project architect) presented her project and responded to questions about the plans, chronology of the unpermitted work, the originality of the windows, and the historic garage.

Public Comment: None

Discussion/Vote:

Commissioners discussed the difficulty of understanding the drawings as to what was original, what is current, and what is being proposed. Better graphics are needed to convey that information. Commissioners also discussed metal window replacements, sky lites, and the proposed garage addition.

The Commission voted 5-0 (Conte-Lesak) to **CONTINUE** this item so that the applicant can provide clearer plans that illustrate the sequence of events including plans of what was originally permitted, plans of what was not permitted, and plans for construction that is being proposed.

NEW BUSINESS

9. **629 Grand Avenue**

A conceptual review for a new one car garage with attached second unit as well as trellis structure attached to the main house for a second covered parking space. The original garage was demolished without permits. This item is for discussion purposes only; no decision shall be made at this time.

Presentation:

Isabel Ivanov (Property Owner) presented her proposal and solicited comments from the Commission.

Discussion:

Commissioners agreed that the proposed trellis is unnecessary and that the demolition of the garage is understandable. According to photos of the new one-car garage, the design seemed acceptable. The Commission requested better drawings of the garage upon submittal of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

10. **1812 Fletcher Avenue**

A conceptual review to replace an existing one car garage with a new 637 square foot garage. The proposal also includes a new 196 square foot trellised structure. Both the garage and trellised structure will be located behind the house. All exterior materials are proposed to match the existing house. This item is for discussion purposes only; no decision shall be made at this time.

Presentation:

Denise Tomlin presented her propose project and solicited comments from the Commission.

Discussion:

Commissioners commented on a well-designed garage. There were concerns about the scale and massing of the project. There was further discussion about stabilizing the existing garage and how to keep similar structures that can no longer be used for its original purpose.

Commissioners requested documentation to show the garage's deterioration. The Commission will also consider the development pattern of the neighborhood when this project is presented for a Certificate of

Appropriateness.

COMMUNICATIONS

11. **Comments from Council Liaison**

None.

12. **Comments from Commission**

Commissioner McLane spoke about his visit and tour of the San Pascual stables in South Pasadena.

Commissioner Lesak reported on the City Council's selection of a Downtown Project Ad Hoc Committee. He wants the City Council to consider the addition of a Cultural Heritage Commissioner.

Commissioner Conte requested to have a review of Mills Act Contracts. Mr. Conte also noted that the public should have access to a set of guidelines for presenting "Conceptual Reviews"

Commissioner Howell-Ardilla spoke about the rating codes and their descriptions on the agenda.

13. **Comments from South Pasadena Preservation Foundation Liaison**

Commissioner Lesak spoke about plans for the City's 125th Anniversary celebration to be held on March 2, 2013.

14. **Comments from Staff**

None

MINUTES

15. **Minutes of the regular meeting of October 18, 2012**

The Commission did not vote on the minutes; they were not included in the agenda packet.

16. **Minutes of the regular meeting of November 15, 2012**

The Commission did not vote on the minutes; they were not included in the agenda packet.

17. **Minutes of the regular meeting of December 20, 2012**

The Commission did not vote on the minutes; they were not included in the agenda packet.

18. **Minutes of the regular meeting of January 17, 2013**

The Commission did not vote on the minutes; they were not included in the agenda packet.

ADJOURNMENT

19. **Meeting Adjourned at 11:59 p.m. to the regular meeting of March 21, 2013.**



Robert Conte, Chair

Date

